



SYMPOSIUM ON 'THE EFFECTIVENESS AND JUDICIAL EDUCATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL LAW IN FRANCOPHONE AFRICA'



(Yaounde, 05 – 09 February 2018)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION	4
II. OPENING CEREMONY.....	6
III. SCIENTIFIC SEGMENT: VALIDATION OF THE TRAINING MANUAL.....	10
IV. METHODOLOGY FOR EVALUATION OF THE EFFECTIVENESS OF ENVIRONMENTAL LAW: LEGAL INDICATORS.....	14
V. SEGMENT FOR THE TRAINING OF TRAINERS	19
VI. RECOMMENDATIONS	28
VII. EVALUATION	30
ANNEX 1 - CONCEPT NOTE.....	33
ANNEX 2 - LIST OF PARTICIPANTS	37

ABBREVIATIONS/ACRONYMS

COMIFAC	Central African Forest Commission
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
ENAM	National School of Administration and Magistracy
IFDD	Francophonie Institute for Sustainable Development
IUCN	The International Union for the Conservation of Nature
NGO	Non-Governmental Organizations
OIF	International Organization of La Francophonie
UNEP	United Nations Environmental Program

I. INTRODUCTION

From the 05 – 09 of February 2018, at DJEUGA PALACE HOTEL, Yaounde, Cameroon hosted the symposium on the theme: effectiveness of Environmental Law and the Integration of Environmental Matters in Judicial Education in Francophone Africa countries (concept note attached as annex 1). The symposium was jointly organised by the International Organisation of La Francophonie (OIF), through her subsidiary organ -Francophonie Institute for Sustainable Development (IFDD), United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), the International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN) in partnership with the Commission of Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS Commission). Under the chairmanship of Cameroonian Minister of Environment, Protection of Nature and Sustainable Development, Hon HELE Pierre the meeting brought together more than sixty (60) participants from seventeen countries, among whom were teachers and practitioners of environmental law, managers and teachers of judicial training institutions in African countries (list of participants attached as annex 2).

1. Context and Justification

The domain of environmental law has increasingly become one in which the gap between legal norms and their practical implementation has grown wider and the effects felt in our everyday lives.

At present, states have made efforts to create *ad hoc* institutions with the mission to evaluate the effects of laws; some efforts have taken the form of committees or councils in charge of evaluation of public policy. The services in charge of general inspection in the ministries in charge of the environment are equally engaged in the evaluation of laws on the bases of the activities of their decentralised territorial services. All these studies and experiments only concern the specific aspects of environmental policies as well as special phases in the implementation of laws. But we do not have a comprehensive view of all the stages involved in the implementation of legal texts.

As of now, official reports on environmental policy obtained from reports and studies on “the state of the environment” do not enable us give an exact account of the existence or effectiveness of environmental laws.

Meanwhile, those who are in charge of the enforcement of these laws, including the judiciary, do not have a good understanding of the environmental laws. This weak understanding on matters relating to the environment constitutes a major impediment in the implementation of environmental laws considering the primordial role that legal systems play in the enforcement of laws. Moreover, the judge has a major role to play in the promotion of environmental law which is a relatively new branch of law that is still undergoing development in African countries.

For the success of environmental law, the collaboration with some institutions in charge of training African magistrates is imperative, notably in Francophone Africa, so as to ensure that the fundamental elements of environmental laws are incorporated in judicial training programmes. This will enable judges and magistrates to be abreast with environmental legislation as well as the establishment and complete integration of environmental considerations. In addition, this will ensure that the subject matter of environmental law is at the same level with other branches of law when these judicial authorities interpret the law.

Pursuant to the above objective, environmental law experts in 2017 did some work for the elaboration of a preliminary version of a training manual tailored to suit Francophone magistrates, which could also help to strengthen the capacity of the public at large on environmental law. Legal indicators that serve the purpose of measuring the effectiveness of environmental law were also elaborated. These two documents need to be studied, improved upon and reviewed by peers within the framework of consultation in a high level scientific committee in order to guarantee their quality and credibility.

2. Objectives and Expected Results (concept note and programme attached as annex 1)

Objectives:

- To develop a procedure for evaluating and measuring the effectiveness of environmental legislation at the national and international level;
- To validate a methodological guide for evaluating the effectiveness of environmental law;
- To validate an appropriate training manual in French for judicial training institutes in Francophone Africa;

- To elaborate a plan of action and a training programme for judges and magistrates in environmental law as well as a related training guide for the training of trainers on environmental law for the judicial organ.

Expected outcomes:

- The methodological guide for evaluating the efficiency of environmental law is validated;
- A French manual for judicial training institutes in Francophone Africa is validated;
- A regional plan of action for the integration of environmental law in institutions and training programmes for magistrates and judges is conceived;
- A curriculum for judicial training institutes on environmental law in the five French African countries is developed;
- Competences on the means of sensitisation and / or training of the judicial organ on environmental law at the national level is shared;
- A pool of trainers on environmental law is put in place for the institutes of judicial training.

II. OPENING CEREMONY

The opening ceremony involved two major activities:

- Speeches from high level personalities, and
- A presentation on the state of the environment.

1. Speeches from High Level Personalities

a) A speech from the representative of UN Environment, Mr. Robert WABUNOH.

The speaker stated that the importance of environmental law need not be overemphasised in a world in which environmental considerations are fundamental to any development process. He then highlighted the fact that despite the consecration of environmental considerations in constitutions and specific laws on the subject in most African countries, the management of the environment poses a number of problems. This raises the need to strengthen the role of the judiciary in the effective implementation of environmental law. He further stated that it is

for this reason that UN Environment supports a number of activities in Africa aimed at boosting the capacities of the police and the judiciary in the application of environmental law. This symposium therefore meets with the objective of UN Environment to establish a platform for experience sharing and exchange for a common approach to judicial training on environmental issues in Africa.

b) Speech from the representative of *La Francophonie*, Pr. Alain ONDOUA, Director of the *Agence Universitaire de la Francophonie*, Office for Central Africa and the Great Lakes Region.

After highlighting the contemporary environmental challenges that the African continent faces, such as the outburst of natural disasters, famine, loss of biodiversity and climate change, the speaker stressed on the role of the respective partners in the continuous search for lasting solutions to the problems highlighted. He equally appealed to the participants of the symposium to enrich the various tools that serve for the promotion of environmental law. These tools will surely help to bring to light the place and role of the law in environmental policies in French-speaking Africa. This therefore highlights the importance of the role that judicial institutions play alongside policymakers for the effectiveness of environmental law. In her readiness to promote the effectiveness of environmental law, *la Francophonie* (OIF) supported the elaboration of the tools that will serve as an object of exchange for this symposium. On the other hand, OIF will support judicial training in environmental law in five institutions in Africa.

c) Speech from the representative of IUCN, Dr. Awaiss ABOUBACAR, Regional Coordinator of the Programme on Water and Wetlands under the Central and West African Programme.

Dr. Awaiss ABOUBACAR started by stressing the fact that the major problem that we face with environmental law in Africa is the issue of its implementation. In 2012, IUCN and (OIF) developed a joint plan of action of IUCN – OIF which contains six points relating to environmental law in Africa. The results of this plan of action set the pace for a joint action of African countries for an enhanced implementation of environmental law. The Colloquium of Abidjan in 2013 followed by that of Rabat in 2016 raised two recommendations for strengthening capacities of judicial personnel in matters of environmental law which have now been taken as the two objectives of the present symposium. He equally highlighted the

fact that the final results of this symposium shall be submitted to the validation by African bodies, notably the African Ministerial Conference on Environment. Finally, the speaker recalled the end result of all these actions which is to bring environmental law closer to the users among whom we have magistrates.

d) Speech from the representative of the Ministry of Justice, Keeper of the Seals (MINJUSTICE).

The Secretary General of MINJUSTICE, Mr. FONKOUÉ, pointed out the willingness of the government of Cameroon to promote environmental law. In effect, environmental law as consecrated in the Constitution of Cameroon is a multidisciplinary transversal branch of law that touches on various sectors of life. He indicated the recent introduction of the module of environmental litigation in the National School of Administration and Magistracy (abbreviated ENAM in French).

e) Opening speech from the Minister in Charge of Environment, Protection of Nature and Sustainable Development.

Mr. HELE Pierre, Minister in Charge of Environment, Nature Protection and Sustainable Development, pointed out that implementation of environmental law has an important stake in environmental protection. After recalling the objectives of this symposium, he pointed out the fact that the association of the judiciary with the constitutional right to a healthy environment should be translated into everyday actions. Equally, the inclusion of environmental law and their effective use in the work of magistrates will contribute to the effectiveness and efficiency of environmental law. He ended by wishing the participants rich exchanges in a bid to attain the expected results among which is the adoption of a training manual and regional plan of action.

2. A presentation on the state of the environment in Africa

In accordance with the agenda of the symposium, this presentation was done by Mr. Robert WABUNOHA who started by indicating environmental challenges and opportunities in Africa. In effect, African natural capital is made up of significant natural resources among which we have arable lands, resources on the soil and subsoil as well as marine resources. The paradox is that Africa loses a lot of money from the exploitation of these resources due

to illicit financial outflows, corruption and the effects of degraded land as well as the impacts of climate change.

He equally addressed the question of management of trans-boundary resources at the regional level; conflicts related to water resources and domestic pollution. One major limitation lies in the weak application of governance mechanisms, laws and regulations. To overcome this, we need to lay down strategies and implement actions for sustainable management of African natural resources. As such, the role of the judiciary and other legal actors appears to be the key to success in the implementation of environmental policies.

The opening ceremony ended with a family photo.



III. SCIENTIFIC SEGMENT: VALIDATION OF THE TRAINING MANUAL

Under the moderation of Pr. Bernard NGUIMDO, this stage was marked by a presentation from MINJUSTICE followed by the presentation of the training manual on environmental law.

1. Presentation of the Secretary General of the Ministry of Justice in Cameroon

In his presentation, Justice FONKOUE stressed the importance of judicial training in the general chain of implementation of environmental law. The major challenge boils down to one question: how can Africa and Cameroon strengthen their capacities to execute environmental law ordinarily perceived as being relatively ‘new’?

He also made an inventory not only of texts that relate to the environment as well as other sectorial laws that both constitute the internal normative framework on environmental law, but also the international legal instruments ratified by Cameroon on the subject.

In environmental law practice in Cameroon, an action can be filed before the administrative judge, the civil judge as well as the criminal judge.

As concerns the training of magistrates in Africa, a preponderant place is not given to acquisition of knowledge on environmental law; rather, this lacuna is covered by university studies that introduce future actors of the judiciary to the discipline in question. In Cameroon for example, efforts have been made to cover this vacuum in ENAM in which a module on environmental litigation has been introduced for a number of years now. For magistrates who did not go through such education, continuous training is envisaged to enable them to be up-to-date.

This presentation was followed by exchanges through which a number of questions were raised concerning:

- The experience in teaching environmental litigation in ENAM, Cameroon;
- The role of civil society in effectiveness of environmental law and more precisely, in bringing actions to court;
- The paucity of environmental case law;

- The inability of the judge to sensitize him/herself in matters of environmental litigation;
- The issue of compromise (transaction) that limits the number of cases in environmental jurisdictions;
- These questions were answered both by the presenter as well as other participants.

The module of environmental litigation was introduced in ENAM in the 2011 – 2012 academic year. This is a course taught to both judicial and administrative officers.

As concerns the civil society, other actors such as NGOs and associations play an important role in environmental law. Once these actors satisfy the conditions necessary for filing cases in court, their complaints become admissible. There are a few examples of cases filed in court by these entities. They sometimes encounter problems relating to their legality under Cameroonian Law. There is a need to sensitise the various actors involved in environmental matters on their capacity to file actions in court.

Concerning the question on paucity of case law, it was highlighted that the real problem is not one of the quantity of cases decided but the quality of the decisions rendered. So does the judge who is solicited interpret environmental law with a good understanding of the subject before passing judgement?

The question of self-seizure was answered to the effect that in Cameroonian procedural law, just as it is the case with the majority of African countries, the judge cannot solicit himself. On the contrary, the State Counsel, standing magistrate, in his double role as judicial and executive personality, has the competence based on public interest considerations to solicit himself in any matter relating to environmental law.

Negotiations are the most common way by which disputes are settled in environmental law practice. It is an alternative method of settlement of disputes but which does not prevent either party to file a case in the event of failure to strike a compromise. This is actually a medium of facilitation of procedures in accordance with the adage: “a bad negotiation is better than a good trial.” This is envisioned by reason of the socio-economic impact of the trial on the cost of the litigants. The question now is to know whether the negotiations between the parties leads to any reparation of the damage caused to the environment or an

end to the threats caused to it. So it is therefore the administration of justice that has the task of monitoring the correction of the offences involved.

2. Presentation of the Training Manual by Pr. KAM YOGO

Pr. KAM YOGO pointed out that the elaboration of the manual is done in a context of lack of environmental knowledge on the part of judicial personnel in Africa, notably on the part of magistrates. So this training manual is meant to be an initial and practical effort that requires a dynamic tool to be used by the pupil magistrate as well as the trainer. The document opens with an introduction, a body of 13 chapters and a conclusion. These chapters respectively deal with:

- *The principles of environmental law;*
- *Tools in the protection of environmental law;*
- *Environmental taxation;*
- *Protection of biodiversity;*
- *The protection of forests;*
- *The protection of marine resources;*
- *The fight against pollutions and nuisances;*
- *Pollution caused by wastes and dangerous substances;*
- *Protection of cultural heritage;*
- *Management of natural disasters and prevention of risks;*
- *Institutions in charge of environmental protection;*
- *Environmental inspections;*
- *Environmental litigation.*

Pr. KAM YOGO equally underlined the fact that the manual contains hypothetical exercises.

Certain concerns were raised in the course of the exchanges that followed his presentation, some of which are:

- The need to emphasise on the domain of environmental law in relation to doctrine and other disciplines;

- Mention of the sources, the actors and evolution of environmental law as well as its recent innovations such as constitutional environmental law which has a jurisdictional impact;
- Application of international law within the context of local court decisions. Magistrates should be brought to take stock of international conventions related to the environment, notably those that have been ratified by their respective countries;
- Establishment of a link between civil, commercial and business laws which all have an impact on environmental law as well as non-constraining approaches as and also the recent problems encountered in environmental law which can all be addressed within the context of implementation of environmental law by the judge;
- The proposal of an alphabetic index;
- Integration of the socio-cultural dimension of environmental law in order to take on board some regional and national conditions necessary for its implementation;
- Instead of talking about environmental institutions, it would be better to talk of environmental governance so as to take into account the diversity of actors so as to include even those that are non-institutional and highlighting their role;
- The document should be structured in such a way as to bring out the specificities of environmental law that directly concern the judge in order that the document should be adapted to the realities of his profession;
- Develop hypothetical cases for each thematic on environmental law so as to enhance the understanding of the target users –the magistrates;
- The document should highlight some of the environmental problems at the global and regional levels as well as the different philosophical trends on the necessity to protect the environment all in a bid to enable the magistrate have a better understanding of the national stakes;
- Besides raising the issue of marine pollution, the questions on trans boundary resources should equally be raised as well as litigations that are transnational in nature;
- The principle of retrogression should equally feature towards the end of the document.

IV. METHODOLOGY FOR EVALUATION OF THE EFFECTIVENESS OF ENVIRONMENTAL LAW: LEGAL INDICATORS

This thematic was presented by **Pr. Michel PRIEUR** and **Christophe BASTIN** and it revolved around the following seven issues:

1. Introduction to the notion of effectiveness

This presentation by Pr. PRIEUR led to the understanding that in order to better appreciate the effectiveness of environmental law we need some legal indicators. This idea was introduced in the colloquia of Abidjan and Rabat and till now remains only theoretical and novel and with the help of special tools, it could serve the purpose of evaluating the implementation of environmental law. The criteria of effectiveness that were elaborated through questionnaires constitute a medium by which to make visible and tangible evaluation for purposes of decision-making. To this end, qualitative data must be transformed into quantitative data. Effectiveness appears as a link that drives the norms to facts through the implementation of these norms by administrations, citizens and the judge. To this end, it enables us have an x-ray of the various stages in the legal chain.

To date, the implementation of environmental law is evaluated through evaluation reports of public policies, inspection reports of and by administrations, reports of other institutions, reports from international organisations and other reports from scholars and researchers.

The legal components of its effectiveness are: existence of the rule, its validity, entry into force, its precision, administrative control, jurisdictional control, applicability of administrative controls, and control by citizens and courts. There are extra-judicial factors that are political, economic and financial, social, cultural and psychological in nature and they play a non-negligible role in enriching the effectiveness of legal indicators. Thus in order to measure the effectiveness or ineffectiveness of law, it would be necessary to:

- ✓ Consider that each legal condition or factor of effectiveness can be translated into legal indicators;
- ✓ Consider that every legal indicator can be evaluated either in an objective or subjective manner;
- ✓ Quantify more or less as contributing to effectiveness;

- ✓ Do a mathematical measurement.

At the end of this introductory presentation, the preoccupations of the participants were centred on the following:

- The difference between effectiveness and efficacy which brings to light the participation of other entities that are not legally empowered to take legal acts for implementation of the rule of law;
- The need for an opening which is different from the general domain of the law in order to reconcile doctrines, socio-political and economic interests considering the fact that the law in general and environmental law in particular are inscribed in a social system of interdependence;
- The necessity to integrate custom as a constitutive element of legal norm and not as an exogenous element to the norm;
- The recognition of non-jurisdictional modes of settlement of disputes;
- The finality of indicators relating to the environment: will it be appropriate to consider them under the global trend of indicators of development? What would be their link with other non-legal indicators such as socio-economic indicators?
- The quality of the analysis of the impact of norms is necessary as it enables us determine whether the law has created any impact on the environment or not. This makes it necessary not to exclude the indicators of efficiency in the evaluation of the rule of law.

From the various clarifications made by Pr. PRIEUR, it became clear that it is necessary to link this innovative approach to the objective of sustainable development in order to enable the pertinence of legal indicators of environmental law. In effect, in a scientific approach to the elaboration of indicators, effectiveness is actually a precise evaluation that reinforces the indicators of efficiency.

2. Why do we need legal indicators on the environment?

Present data relating to the effectiveness of environmental law is obtained through reports of international conventions, international organisations, the UN, EU and UA. These reports do not provide explanations on the implementation of environmental law. This is the reason why

the legal indicators of environment will help in filling a factual and theoretical vacuum. These indicators can serve the following purposes:

- Provide policymakers with a tool for evaluating environmental policies and their implementation;
- Provide the judge with information on the trends and results of implementation of environmental law;
- Provide information to citizens on environmental law;
- Draw each other's attention to the objectives, obstacles, lacunas, the level of progress and regression of environmental law;
- Scientifically measure the degree of effectiveness of environmental law.

One of the major stakes is to contribute to the amelioration of environmental indicators contained in instruments from organisations like the World Bank and the UN. In effect, the Assembly of the UN on Environment that held in Nairobi in December 2017 clearly recommended **'the provision of indicators that are more multidisciplinary'**.

At the end of this presentation, the various concerns revolved around:

- The need to submit the problem of legal indicators on environmental law to the African Ministerial Conference on Environment;
- The interest of UNEP in legal indicators within the framework of environmental governance;
- The importance of bringing together and sensitising international and sub-regional institutions as well as the organs of management of specific conventions on the new approach of legal indicators on environmental law in the system of evaluation. This in effect is a sort of pledge to these institutions to make them learn of this procedure and promote its integration;
- The necessity to elaborate indicators that specifically correspond to African problems such as pastoralism and sanitation;
- In the formulation of indicators, we need to take into consideration the instruments of non-compliance which is present in many conventions and to valorise existing indicators in certain conventions such as the Paris Agreement on Climate Change.

3. Legal indicators as tools for evaluating the effectiveness of environmental law

This presentation enabled the clarification of the territorial scope of implementation (international, regional, national and local); the material or substantial scope of implementation (a law of general or of specific application) as well as the interdependence between effectiveness and efficiency. Legal indicators are grouped into four categories which are: existential, institutional, substantial indicators and indicators of procedure. As such, for every theme, these four categories of legal indicators need to be addressed. Questionnaires may be filled by jurists or non-jurists and targeted interviews can also enable us to collect data that has been treated in an aggregated manner so as to obtain a minimum average based on the importance accorded by the respective actors. The major stages involved in evaluation of efficiency include:

- Identification of indicators through qualitative and/or quantitative data obtained from the questionnaires;
- Hierarchical organisation of this data based on the value that it has for each indicator;
- Validation of the hierarchical classification;
- Conversion into figures and measurement by mathematicians or statisticians;
- Validation of the measurement by a mixed panel of jurists and mathematicians;
- Aggregation of the data according to the various themes.

However, before applying legal indicators on environmental law to states, it is necessary to:

1. Review and enrich the 17 questionnaires through consultation of peers;
2. Hierarchically classify the respective values given to each indicator by the peers;
3. Apply the mathematical method of measurement to the 17 questionnaires in order to obtain numeric results;
4. Elaborate the indications of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) that are particular to the environment;
5. Draw lessons from the results by way of appraisal of the law that is implemented or not implemented;
6. Determine the privileged domains for the elaboration of other indicators.

At the end of this presentation, the various reactions were on the following:

- The necessity to integrate an indicator of efficiency by establishing a link between the substance, content of the rule and efficiency;
- Clarifications on the system of sampling; their representation in relation to the possibilities of extrapolation; the complementary criterion of interviews in relation to the questionnaires that they enrich;
- The need to elaborate an indicator for article 26 of the Vienna Convention on the obligation of states to apply treaties that they ratify in good faith in order to contribute to the effectiveness of environmental law;
- The necessity to extend legal indicators to unilateral acts or directives.

4. How do we measure the effectiveness of environmental law?

This presentation was all about establishing the fact that the system of measurement of the effectiveness of environmental law is based on the practical implementation of this branch of law. In order to obtain such measurement, we must be able to transpose qualitative data into quantitative data. To this effect, one must master information gathering but remaining factual so as to minimise every form of subjectivity. States have an economic interest in this because indicators that represent effectiveness provide us with a more global vision which will enable us measure efficiency. So the measurement of effectiveness passes through the following:

- Graduation in order to determine value chain;
- Data collection;
- Timing of the various criteria of the system;
- Graphical representation of the system.

These operations permit us obtain a cardboard; a pilot tool and an aid to decision making that permits us concentrate resources on the scientific aspects of environmental law in order to achieve efficiency in actions. Analysis of the investigated data enables us identify the weak points of effectiveness in relation to a rule of law. It has been mentioned already that this instrument has to be used in time and fashioned in a way as to permit auto-evaluation in a bid to limit the costs of measurement.

The following points were raised at the end of this presentation:

- Determination of the margin of error taking into account the possible interference of new elements;

- Does the experience of administering questionnaires enable the determination of domains that are more effective than other?
- The importance in giving a no response enhances the pertinence of the questionnaire;
- The administration of the questionnaire must go along with an animator who will help the person questioned to the elaboration of the answer, but not the orientation of the answer.

The emphasis was on the level of the current stage which is that of measurement and not statistics that need to be implemented with time. Equally, this system of measurement appears to be practical and it is based on factual and pragmatic findings since it enables us determine the axes of progress in relation to priorities defined.

The last presentation relating to the effectiveness of environmental law and legal indicators had to do with an exposé on the next phases of the project which are:

- 1. Conception of the disposition** through the establishment of a committee of jurists and a scientific committee.
- 2. Experimentation** which has to do with the training of jurists for enquiries; determination of the perimeter for sampling; treatment of data and validation of the system of measurement'
- 3. Application** which is done through scientific exploitation.

V. SEGMENT FOR THE TRAINING OF TRAINERS

The segment meant for the training of trainers was marked by a number of presentations on the content and scope of environmental law; capacity building for the implementation of environmental legislations within the framework of the WA-BiCC programme relating to the continuous training of magistrates under the theme, the fight against criminality related to the fauna within member states of ECOWAS; evaluation of the need for judicial training on the subject: approaches, tools and challenges; the role of a judicial trainer or instructor on environmental law; techniques for developing curricula and plan of action for the training on environmental law.

1. Scope and content of environmental law by Dr. Pulcherie DONOUMASSOU SIMEON.

The presentation brought the following issues to limelight:

a) The elements of environmental law characterised as:

- **An evolving branch of international law** translated by multilateral environmental agreements on fauna, flora, pollutions, alteration of global ecological order, common interest of the global system of Rio, community regulations and directives, customary international rules, declarations and charters and international jurisprudence.
- **A specific branch of national law** constituted by the constitution, ratified international conventions, framework law or environmental codes, sectorial laws (such as laws on health, energy, water, land, forest, etc.), regulatory texts, customary rules, charters and other non-legal instruments and case law. It should be indicated that this national law is marked by the profusion of norms, difficulties in domestication of ratified conventions, contradiction in rules and the multiplicity of procedures.

b) The Scope of Environmental Law brings to light the authority of this discipline considering that environmental obligations bind all the actors in the state, such as: the state, judges, associations and NGOs and in effect everybody, when we look at it from a constitutional perspective. Efforts geared towards the implementation of environmental law can be seen through the elaboration of texts, creation of institutions, control organs, periodic reports addressed to the secretariats of international conventions, the delegation of focal points, through some court decisions and actors involved in control. The constitutional, administrative, civil and criminal judges can now entertain environmental litigations. The major obstacle relating to environmental litigation is the establishment of proof. In a bid to reinforce the implementation of environmental law, it is necessary to:

- Coordinate the production of international and national law;
- Training actors on legislative matters;
- Mobilise the various means of recourse;
- Develop procedures for the quantification of damage;
- Follow up the implementation of decisions;

- Evaluate effectiveness.

The following preoccupations were raised in the course of the exchanges:

Emphasis on the definition of law given by Alexander Kiss which was mentioned in the introduction of the presentation but which seems insufficient as it does not include the natural law origin of environmental law which transcends its normative origins;

As concerns the content of environmental law, it was suggested that the evolutionary characteristics of international law should be brought out, as well as its proliferation at the national level;

The place of internal laws relating to the environment confronted with international regulations; the link between the incompetence of judges and lack of training; causes of the subtleness of judicial sanctions, could this be the result of cases that are not tried to the end or simply the adoption of weak sanctions?

2. Capacity building for the implementation of environmental legislations by

BOUGONOU KOUASSIVI DJERI-ALASSANI (ECOWAS)

The presenter started by recalling the strategic framework based on articles 3, 29, 30 and 31 of the revised ECOWAS treaty that has the objective to help member states develop their capacities for a better implementation of environmental legislations. The WA-BICC project is therefore based on specific conventions, strategies and declarations relating to the fights against illegal exploitation and trade in wild Fauna and Flora in Africa. So training activities for administrative officials and judicial personnel in matters of understanding and implementing environmental law were organised in the past two years. The following lessons were learned from the experience:

- The importance in creating frameworks for mutual exchange and learning between environmental jurists and specialists;
- The necessity for making the difference between legal systems for countries of French or English culture in the initiation of regional training programmes;
- The need to maximise such training opportunities for countries of the sub-region in order to have a vast population of jurists who have mastery in environmental issues;

- The paucity in legislation in certain countries and inadequacy of sanctions that have consequently lost their deterrence as they are not rigorous enough.

The exchanges that followed this presentation were marked by testimonies from the representatives of Togo and Gabon as they took part in the training under the said programme. They stressed on the need to capitalise on such training at the national level in each country and the multiplication of the different means of recourse in case of violation of environmental norms; revision of the forestry code and amelioration of synergy between professionals, notably increased collaboration between the ministry of justice and of the environment. It is in fact in this light that the Central African Forest Commission (COMIFAC) laid down an audit for the legality of forest exploitation in Gabon. In Togo on the other hand, the strengthening of sanctions was highlighted.

The importance of codification was also highlighted as it enables the examination of existing codes both in the regulatory and legislative domain.

3. The experience of integration of environmental law in judicial training institutions English-speaking African countries, by Philippe Rene NSOA, head of the judicial section of ENAM – Cameroon

The presenter pointed out the environmental stakes and challenges and the major factors that limit the implementation of environmental law in Africa.

The Johannesburg Plan of January 2017 on the integration of environmental education in judicial training institutions envisages an evaluation of training needs, training programmes and integration plans, training guides for trainers and directives for implementation; a framework for follow up and evaluation; the creation of Green Desks; a data base on environmental legislation and jurisprudence as well as an African network for the training of magistrates.

The training programme is equally expected to cover the following domains:

A general perception of environmental law; contemporary environmental opportunities and challenges; fundamental principles and concepts of environmental law; the sources of environmental law; sanctions and means of recourse; procedural aspects, environmental rights, alternative modes of resolution of environmental disputes; challenges relating to

competence, management of complex environmental cases; cost and advantages of environmental degradation; the study of pertinent cases; approaches to sustainable development; access to courts and public interest litigations.

Despite the generous adherence of certain partners and some noticeable political will, there are still some obstacles relating to resistance to plans of action, conflicting priorities in many countries, adhesion of Supreme Courts and the issue of financing.

At the end of the presentation, participants had the following reactions:

- The necessity to bring clarity on the notion of Green Desk, notably its definition and content;
- Obstacles relating to the harmonisation of texts.

As concerns the first reaction, the presenter explained that the notion of Green Desk is all about the establishment of information and exchange centres on environmental law that induces the implication of pupil magistrates in the collection of data and the search for environmental information, notably the collection of case law.

As concerns the second reaction, it is noticed that the level of interpretation and conception of the existing rule of law (national, regional and international, through the interference of the International Court of Justice) is weak, for an authentic interpretation and thus the heightened need to train magistrates in this regard.

4. Evaluation of environmental needs in schools of magistracy: approaches, tools and perspectives, presentation done by Mr. Yacouba SAVADOGO, IUCN

The presenter discussed the role of development of environmental law which translates the function of the constitutional judge, jurisprudence and the function of interpretation of the judge. Emergency procedures that are specific for environmental law considering the gravity of certain situations appear to be a solution to the lengthy nature of classical adjudication. The present state of affairs as far as the environmental education of judges is concerned enables us to highlight the following:

- Absence of environmental education in the general formation of magistrates in most African countries;

- The current practice is the organisation of workshops for the training of magistrates in matters of environmental law which is quite costly and yet do not produce any significant number of trained magistrates.

The most appropriate method would be to get to the schools of magistracy and integrate environmental education in their training curricula. To this effect, emphasis should be made on jurisprudence in the training components; permit pupil magistrates to take part in environmental litigations and invitation of environmental specialists in the training.

The following observations were made at the end of this presentation:

- The necessity to adopt a special procedure for updating top-ranking judges such as judges of the Supreme Court and Constitutional Court;
- The creation of 'green tribunals' puts to question the transversal nature of environmental considerations as well as the very nature of the trial which may possibly fall within the competence of the administrative, civil, criminal and even commercial judge, as the case may be;
- The problem of severity of sanctions as a factor of deterrence in the effective implementation of environmental law;
- View the already charged up nature of training programmes, the objective should be to ignite the interest of magistrates in the subject and provide them with the means to implement this branch of law.

5. Round table on principles of judicial education in different countries

This exercise paved the way for experience sharing from different countries, notably Madagascar, Niger, Congo, Chad, Togo, Burundi, Benin, Central African Republic, Gabon and Guinea Conakry. It was noticed that the majority of schools of magistracy are placed under the guardianship of the Ministry of Justice and they are attached to the school of administration from an institutional standpoint and some countries have decided to make them separate entities. Besides judicial auditors, we have auxiliaries of justice who are also included in certain training programmes. Environmental education in schools of magistracy is still something new for countries that have introduced it and for most of these countries, it is still inexistent.

6. Importance of the perception of environmental law, by Christophe Bastin, *Sic Nouvelle Aquitaine, France*

This presentation was aimed at examining the heterogeneity in the various responses in accordance with the order that was arbitrarily set up in the value chain. The major question was on the uniformity of the methods of understanding and grading of the exercise in order to achieve identical results. We noticed the necessity to gather indicators in groups based on the different interests as well as the preliminary training of inquirers considering the density of the domain of environmental law and variations in the internal preoccupations of various countries. If there is no interest to act, then there is no action; each country sets her own priorities dependent on her bases.

7. The role of the judicial trainer or instructor in environmental law, by Sophie LAVALLEE, University of Laval (Quebec), scientific committee of LEF - Francophonie institute for sustainable development (IFDD)

The presentation unfolded via five points:

1. The need for sensitisation on the role of the judge in this domain of the law through the creation, effectiveness, evolution and enrichment of law;
2. Teach the sources and methods of the discipline;
3. Teach the ‘founding mechanisms’ of environmental law in order to have a good start point;
4. Teach the course as a lively one with numerous jurisprudential examples;
5. Teach the methodology for resolution of legal problems relating to the environment through intensive and increased training.

In the end, the presenter pointed out that teaching cannot transmit environmental knowledge to the magistrate entirely; so there is need for adaptation to national realities and legislation to enable the student acquire the methodological key for understanding and solving issues that fall within the context of environmental litigation.

8. Technique for developing a curriculum and plan of action for training on environmental law, by Dr. Freda GITHIRU, Kenya judicial training institute

She presented a curriculum as a document that contains the object of the training, its content, methodology, beneficiaries or users, expected results and the means by which to achieve them. It is important to draw the difference between a curriculum and a training manual. The latter is in effect a user guide while the former is more detailed and comprises of the following:

The cover page which must carry the title of the programme, the date (considering that changes occur every year) and the articulation of the document;

An introduction;

Learning objectives that make it possible to ask question relating to: the current level of the magistrate undergoing training, the projected level to attain in the coming years and information of the trainer on these objectives;

The themes to be developed must each correspond to the designed objectives;

Practical exercises must be provided at the end of every theme;

The length or duration of the training

The reactions to the presentation revolved around:

- The duration of every training programme;
- The indicators necessary for a good evaluation of a curriculum;
- The criteria for evaluating a curriculum.

As concerns the test of a good curriculum, she pointed out that there is no standard formula; everything depends on the beneficiaries of the training. She equally highlighted the fact that a curriculum is split into two parts: objectives and expected outcomes.

There is no specific definition of the time allocation or duration of training programmes; it all depends on the bases that were defined from the onset. In Kenya for example, magistrates are not trained as professionals; it is a continuous process based on an annual calendar.

At the end of these presentations, group exercises were organised and the results presented to the plenary.

9. Group exercises: evaluation of environmental education in judicial training institutes, by Dr. Freda GITHIRU

Group exercises comprised of three major themes:

- To draw up the cover page of the programme with all the necessary details and identify and formulate the general objectives of the programme;
- Within the framework of the course content, identify a theme to be included in the training programme. Split the theme into sub-themes and formulate three appropriate learning outcomes;
- On the basis of a theme on your curriculum, provide creative and appropriate methods of training that are as precise as possible.

Results of the group exercises:

Group 1:

- Cover page: name of institution, the course title, the author and the year;
- Page two: objectives of the programme (provide magistrates with the necessary capacities with which to handle environmental litigations).

Group 2:

Proposed theme: Environmental Law, a constitutional discipline.

Sub-themes:

- The right to information on matters of environmental law;
- The right to participation in environmental law;
- The right to access to justice in environmental law.

Expected outcomes:

- At the end of the training, the magistrate should be able to:
- Identify, analyse and interpret applicable texts under national, regional and international law (the Constitution, laws, regulations, the African Charter, the Maputo Convention);
- Draw inspiration from case law at the national, regional and international level;

- Identify persons who have the capacity and interest in filing an action under environmental law.

Group 3:

Proposed theme: The sources of environmental law.

These sources can either be customary, conventional or national.

Summarily, the lessons drawn from the various groups are:

Group 1: that the name of the trainer should be taken off but the different lectures should bear the names of the various lecturers;

Group 2: looking at the constitutional nature of environmental law, the subtitles and the objective should be linked up with the central theme. Then proceed with the identification of environmental questions and making them argumentative (it is forbidden to enumerate them);

Group 3: Work for the elaboration of other systems of teaching and methodology (such as teaching by use of questionnaires that are more beneficial to the student since he will be induced to doing research as well as it will enable exchanges between the trainer and the student in a bid to palliate some areas in which the student is lacking).

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

Consequent upon the discussions emanating from the presentations on the effectiveness and judicial education of environmental law in francophone Africa, the following recommendations were formulated.

As concerns the training manual, it was admitted by the majority of participants that the document corresponds to the terms of reference but does not correspond to the direct needs of magistrates being the final users. So each country was enjoined to use the content of the manual only as a framework document for orientation and to adapt it to the specific realities and respective national laws so as to make it become a specific pedagogic national tool.

Besides, participants agreed on the need to improve on the document on the following ways:

- To elaborate more on the introduction addressing issues relating to sources, evolution, philosophical and anthropological trends of environmental law; the situation of environmental law in relation to civil, commercial and criminal law; major global and regional challenges of environmental law; and
- Divide the work into two main parts; one on the consistency/fundamentals of environmental law (international, national legal instruments binding or non-binding, and the institutions), and the other part on environmental litigation together with the different modes (jurisdictional and non-jurisdictional) for the settlement of disputes and their procedures.

As concerns the evaluation of the effectiveness of environmental law,

- Promote at the level of state and sub/regional organs as well as international organisations, considerations and experimentation of legal indicators of environmental law among the tools for evaluating the state of the environment and sustainable development.
- Train investigators and evaluators of environmental law at the national level to enable them lead investigations on the effectiveness of environmental law.
- Integrate in the evaluation of the effectiveness of environmental law, customary norms/rules in accordance with the conditions of the entry into the legal system which include: knowledge of the norm, its legitimacy and its coherence in relation to the internal legal order.
- Include as some of the environmental themes to be evaluated, challenges particular to the continent of Africa such as sanitation, pastoralism, renewable energies and energy efficiency.
- Take into consideration in the formulation of legal indicators, instruments of non-respect which are found in a majority of the conventions and valorise existing indicators in some conventions such as the Paris Agreement on climate change.
- Translate the documents into English and Spanish in order to promote their appropriation by other African countries, Latin America and the rest of the world.
- Participants noted that the Maputo Convention of 11 July 2003 on the conservation of nature and natural resources which entered into force on the 10th of July 2016, could be an indicator of effectiveness of environmental law in Africa. Participants however noted with regret the weak ratification (16 countries) of the convention which is of

course an important regional tool of environmental law in Africa, crucial for the training of magistrates. Participants therefore invite African States which are non-parties to the convention to ratify same and invite the African Union Commission to organise the first meeting of the Parties to the Maputo Convention. In this regard, organisations working in the domain of environmental law notably IUCN are tasked to contribute to the realisation of such mission.

- To set up a think tank on the effective implementation of sub-regional conventions which necessitate internal sponsorship and autonomous financial mechanisms.

For the Training of Trainers,

- Envisage capacity building of high level judges such as those of the Supreme Court and Constitutional Court.
- Document and circulate African case law and network in order to share understanding of the application of environmental law.
- Include people in other disciplines who are involved in the establishment of environmental offences in the training on environmental law.
- Think through the setting up of environmental law information centres, the so-called Green Desks).
- Reinforce, up-grade and vulgarise training on environmental law in training schools.
- Accompany magistrates on service on continuous training on environmental law.
- Develop a curriculum on environmental law in the training in schools of magistracy. In this regard, participants invite OIF, UN Environment and IUCN to bring in their technical and financial support for the elaboration of a curriculum guide at the regional level.

VII. EVALUATION

A global evaluation of the symposium was made by 27 participants from 14 countries of Africa of the Center, western, of Indian Ocean and Europe. The main results are the following:

- In terms of satisfaction, the training completely met the expectations of 42.31% of the participants. For 57.69%, they meet enough their expectations.
- For 60% of the participants, the terms used during the training were very understandable and for the 40%, they were understandable.
- For the allowance of time in the training, 46.15% of the participants considered it as very sufficient, 38.46% considered it sufficient against 15.38% which considered that this time was not sufficient. A better management of time and planning of the agenda are thus recommended during the next similar activities.
- For visual materials, 38.46% of the participants considered the communications very clear and for 61.54%, communications were clear. Besides, for 76.92% of the participants, the materials were very useful and they are ready to keep them for reference, whereas 23.08% found them useful and are also ready to keep them for reference. Although communications are variously appreciated, they were all recognized useful by the set of the participants. The participants expressed on the other hand their wish to have other complementary trainings in other specific domains.
- For all of the participants, that is 100%, the speakers were well.
- 60% of the participants learnt new knowledge which they could apply in their country in a very suitable way. 40% also recognize to have learnt new knowledge which they can way apply in their country. It demonstrates the usefulness of the training and the achievement of the objectives expected by said training.
- 34.62% of the participants acquired new working knowledge which they can apply within the framework of their work in a very satisfactory way. 53.85% of the participants can make it in an exact way. On the other hand, 7.69% of the participants cannot make it in a suitable way and 3.83% are not pronounced. These figures translate the level of technicality of the themes developed. If the themes of legal order are a little bit familiar to the participants who are jurists, those relating to the modelling of the indicators which are purely mathematical ask for a better appropriation, other adequate training are welcome.
- 15.38% of the participants find that the new acquired knowledge is more useful than the taught practical skills, against 23.08% which assert the opposite. On the other hand, for 61.54% of the participants, both, that is the new acquired knowledge and the taught practical skills are placed on the same important level.

- 61.54% of the participants confirm they can use very exactly what they learnt during this training to help their country to reach the environmental goals contained in the international legal instruments, 38.46% assert they can make it in an exact way. These figures translate the capacity of the actors trained to be able to use what they learnt for the benefit of their country.
- 65.38% of the participants assert that the capacities of their institution will be very well strengthened thanks to the experiences of this training, 30.77% recognize it in an exact way, whereas for 3.85%, the capacities of their institutions will not be.
- For 86.96% of the participants, the probability for their participation in other training is very high, for 13.04% which considered it high.
- 34.78% of the participants considered satisfactory the progress of the training 26.09% considered it good and 39.13% of excellent.
- 9.09% of the participants considered that the premises where took place the works of the training are not suited. 45.45% judged it satisfactory for 27.27% of good and 18.18% of excellent.

ANNEX 1 - CONCEPT NOTE

Symposium on effectiveness and judicial education of environmental law in French-speaking Africa

1. Background

Effectiveness of environmental law

Advocating specific indicators capable of reflecting the effectiveness of environmental law implies the acceptance of the relevance of these indicators in order to evaluate one of the most emblematic public policies for the survival and the future of humanity.

Until now, the effectiveness of the law was studied only by legal philosophers and theoreticians, raising the fundamental question: what is the use of the law? Legal sociologists sought to answer the same question on the basis of behavioral surveys that too often were based on subjective assessments. On the ground, many countries have increased the number of ad hoc bodies responsible for assessing the impact of legislation: public policy review committees or councils. The general inspection services of the Ministries of the Environment have also had to carry out assessments of the laws based on their territorial departments' activities. All these studies and experiments have focused only on specific aspects of environmental policies and phases of law enforcement. But a complete picture of all the legal steps leading to the implementation of the texts is not available. Moreover, these evaluations have not been accompanied by specific tools which would make possible to evaluate the effectiveness of the law, in other words the legal conditions for its application, those which will foster respect for the law, instead of the general effects of the law.

The role of the Judiciary

On the other hand, there is a lack of understanding of environmental law by those responsible for its application, namely the judiciary. The judiciary's unresponsive attitude to the environment is a major obstacle in the application of environmental law because of the central role played by the judicial system. Indeed in such civil remedies as the compensation for environmental damage caused to others or criminal sanctions against perpetrators of environmental offenses (imprisonment, fines, site reclamation), only the judge may apply the law and impose sanctions for violating environmental regulations. Apart from the judicial procedure itself, the judge also plays an equally important role in regards to transactions. In many cases, national regulations provide for judicial intervention in transactional procedures. In order to prevent this intervention from being merely informal, it is important to equip the environmental judge with the ability to conduct a sound and rigorous assessment of the conditions of the transaction before it is implemented. Moreover, the judge has a major role to play in promoting environmental law, which is still a relatively recent legal development in African countries.

With this aim, educators on environmental law worked in 2017 to develop a preliminary version of a training manual adapted to French-speaking countries that can be used for the capacity enhancement of the public including judicial officers in environmental law. It also developed legal indicators that could measure the effectiveness of environmental law. These

two documents need to be studied, improved and peer-reviewed by a high level scientific committee to ensure its quality.

In the same breath, the integration of environmental law in the education of judges and magistrates is crucial and timely if an informed judiciary empowered to enforce environmental law is to be a reality.

2. Justification

The goal of the initiative is to create legal indicators, using a scientific basis, which will act as an instrument for measuring the application of environmental law. The creation of legal indicators, like all indicators, is intended to result in quantified "measurements" which allow for raw data to be visualized and prioritized.

The existence of legal indicators could restore the law to its rightful place as one of the necessary factors leading to environmental policy results. As mentioned by legal philosopher Henri Lévy-Bruhl, "Our knowledge of legal facts cannot, no more than that of economic facts, dispense with precise and methodically established numerical data"¹. Therefore, the progress of quantification goes hand in hand with a uniform and universal law and it must be possible to calculate the rules applicable to all mankind². Environmental law is characterized precisely by its Universalist character, because of its application to all humanity.

This desire to re-evaluate environmental law comes at a time when, in many countries, the avalanche of texts in this field leads some to criticize a so-called "punitive" ecology and advocate the suppression or excessive simplification of these texts, thus leading to a regression in the contributions and goals of the environmental policies from the years 1970-1990. To measure this menacing regression in environmental law, it is necessary to be able to describe environmental law's successes and advances.

At the present time, official environmental policy reports, through reports and studies on the state of the environment, do not make it possible to account for the existence or the effectiveness of environmental law.³ Indeed, in these documents, whether national, regional or international, we find only scientific or economic indicators. There is no mention of any legal indicator for the very reason that they do not yet exist⁴. Rarely is there even a mention of an item of legal nature. If one exists, it is not evaluated, either qualitatively or quantitatively. This glaring absence of the law in environmental assessments leads policy-makers and public opinion to underestimate or deny the weight of the law and its usefulness. For this reason, the innovative creation of legal indicators for environmental law can be considered an essential contribution to the evaluation of environmental policies. This evaluation, in turn, will help decision-makers, draw the attention of elected officials and the public to gaps in laws and legal regressions. Finally, and more generally, legal indicators will enable the public and law enforcement officials to be better informed on the reality of the usefulness of environmental law as a factor in the success of environmental policies.

¹ H. Lévy-Bruhl, Note sur la statistique et le droit, in *La statistique. Ses applications, les problèmes qu'elle soulève*, PUF, 1935, p. 141-147

² Condorcet, observations sur le 29^e livre de l'esprit des lois, cited by A. Supiot, op cit. p 153

³ Cf. since 1992 the OECD has reported on "environmental performance reviews of Counties" in which environmental law, although mentioned, is not subject to any in-depth evaluation.

⁴ In the United Nations' lists of environmental and sustainable development indicators, the European Environment Agency, the European Union and various countries, there are no legal indicators.

Further, for the success of environmental law, it becomes imperative to collaborate with selected French-speaking African judicial training institutions to ensure that core elements of environmental law are incorporated in judicial education curricula. This will enable judges and magistrates to be fully conversant with the environmental law with the establishment and full integration of environmental issues in domestic law. Moreover this will ensure the subject is elevated to the same footing as other laws when the judiciaries are interpreting the law.

3. Programme

As a prelude to a 2019-2022 four-year program supporting the advancing of environmental law in Africa, the Institut de la Francophonie pour le développement durable (IFDD), a subsidiary body of the Organisation internationale de la Francophonie (OIF) and the International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN), UN Environment and Economic Commission for West Africa States (ECOWAS), are launching a range of activities to support the effective implementation of environmental law by developing tools for assessing its effectiveness, including legal indicators, and promoting the teaching of environmental law in African magistrate training schools.

The high level scientific meeting aims to validate training tools on environmental law and a methodological guide for assessment of effectiveness of environmental law.

The essence of the scientific meeting is to have a critical review of documents including review of feasibility, relevance and sustainability when requested and to collect recommendations from a multinational body of professors of environmental law to finalize the edition of an appropriate book.

The Train of trainer segment aims to integrate environmental law training for judiciary in (Insert the 5 Francophone Countries) and the development of sustainable environmental law training curriculum that would be used in the Judicial training institutes. The essence of the trainings would be to ensure that persons trained become sensitizers in subsequent workshops.

4. Methodology

The scientific meeting will be used as a peer-review activity to ensure the quality of edited books on environmental law in Africa. For a better use of dedicated time, initial contributions of members of scientific committee will be integrated in the online documents posted on google drive. The scientific meeting is designed to enhance discussion on divergence of points of view and to adopt the consensual documents.

The scientific segment will include: presentation of tools (manual, indicators and methodological guide) by the authors. It will also be the opportunity to introduce the mathematical method of measurement of legal indicators. Panel discussions and exercises will follow presentation. The workshop will be used as a launching pad for sustaining national judicial training programmes on environmental in Africa. The workshop is designed to be flexible and responsive to national needs, equip the participants with skills and materials to train other judicial officers while building upon advances made so far in the region.

The train the trainer segment will include: Training on development of a curriculum; Action planning sessions; Substantive legal aspects; Presentations by resource persons; Panel discussions; and Group discussions and exercises.

5. Objectives

- Develop a process to assess the effectiveness of environmental law at national level.
- Validation of a methodological guide for the assessment of the effectiveness of environmental law.
- Validation of an appropriate training manual in French for judicial schools in French-speaking Africa.
- Develop an action plan and curriculum on judges and magistrates education in environmental law and its associated training materials.
- Train of trainer on environmental law for the judiciary.

6. Outcomes

- A Methodological guide for the assessment of the effectiveness of environmental law.
- A training manual in French for judicial schools in French-speaking Africa.
- A Regional action plan for the integration of environmental law in magistrates and judges training institutions and programmes.
- A Curriculum for the Judicial schools on environmental law in the 5 French countries developed.
- Imparted skills on ways to sensitize and/or train the judiciary on environmental law at the national level.
- A pool of trainers on environmental law developed for the judicial training institutes.

7. Participating Groups

The symposium targets 10 professors of environmental law in different regions of French-speaking areas (North America, Europe, Indian Ocean, West Africa and Central Africa); 10 environmental law professionals mobilized in the production of these tools in order to provide stronger tools accepted by a diverse body of competency and Heads of Judicial training schools, judges and magistrates of French-speaking countries in Africa.

8. Venue and Date

The Venue is from February 5th to February 9th in Yaoundé (Cameroon).

ANNEX 2 - LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

ECOWAS

Bougonou K. DJERI-ALASSANI

ECOWAS commission
101 Yakubu Gowon Crescent
P.M.P. 401 Abuja
NIGERIA

KONRAD ADENAUER FOUNDATION

Oliver C. RUPPEL

Konrad Adenauer Stiftung
Resident Representative and Director
Climate Policy and Energy Security
Programme for Sub-Saharan Africa
PO Box 35593, Yaoundé
CAMEROON

BENIN

Pulchérie DONOUMASSOU SIMEON

Ministère du Cadre de Vie et du Développement Durable,
BENIN

BURKINA FASO

Antoine KABORÉ SANDAOGO

École Nationale d'Administration et de Magistrature
14 BP 152 Ouaga 14
BURKINA FASO

Habib Ahmed DJIGA

École Nationale d'Administration et de Magistrature
14 BP152 Ouaga 14
BURKINA FASO

BURUNDI

Eric NKURUNZIZA

Barreau de Bujumbura
1368 Bujumbura
BURUNDI

Bienvenu NIYONGABO

Barreau de Bujumbura
94 Bujumbura
BURUNDI

CONGO

Andréa Miguel BIMBOU LOUAMBA

École nationale d'administration et de Magistrature
38, rue DJOUEKE Poto-Poto 2
CONGO

Marceau Burnel BIANKOLA BIANKOLA

61 rue Félix Eboué Bacongo
CONGO

FRANCE

Michel PRIEUR

Montaigut
87500 Saint Yrieix la Perche
FRANCE

Christophe BASTIN

SIC- Nouvelle-Aquitaine
38 rue François Chénieux
87000 Limoges
FRANCE

GABON

Allain Georges MOUKOKO

Président de Chambre à la Cour d'appel
B.P. 5455, Libreville
GABON

GUINEA

Laye Moussa CONDE

ENA Guinée MFPREMA
BP 3817 Conakry
GUINEA

Fanta MARA

ENA Guinée
BP 3817 Conakry
GUINEA

ITALIA/MOROCCO

Mohamed Ali MEKOUAR

Professeur associé au CRIDEAU
Ancien professeur de droit à l'Université de Casablanca
Ancien Directeur de la Division de la Conférence, du Conseil et du Protocole de la FAO
Via Bartolomeo Diaz 34 (Int. 43)
00154 Roma

KENYA

Freda MUGAMBI-GITHIRU

Deputy Director Judicial Education and Curriculum Development
Judiciary Training Institute (JTI)
KENYA

MADAGASCAR

Harinirina Saholy RAMBININTSAOTRA

Université d'Antananarivo BP 905

Tahiana Lucette RAKOTOARISAONA

École Nationale de la Magistrature et des Greffes (ENMG)
Lot IVB 254 Ambohimanala, Andoharanofotsy, ANTANANARIVO 102
MADAGASCAR

Monsieur Herizo Rado ANDRIAMANANTENA

École Nationale de la Magistrature et des Greffes (ENMG)
17 Rue, Patrice Lumumba Tsaralalàna
Antananarivo 101, B.P. 552
MADAGASCAR

MALI

Toubaye KONE

Institut National de Formation Judiciaire (INFJ)
BP 97 Ministère de la Justice
MALI

Badra Alou COULIBALY

Institut National de Formation Judiciaire (INFJ)
BP 97 Ministère de la Justice
MALI

RCA

Alexis N'DUI-YABELA

École Nationale d'Administration et de Magistrature
BP.1045 Bangui
RCA

Ossene YACKOISSET WESSEKPAMA

École Nationale d'Administration et de Magistrature
BP.1045 Bangui
RCA

TCHAD

Enock NODJIGOTO

École Nationale de Formation Judiciaire (ENFJ)
BP 426 Ndjamena
TCHAD

SITACK YOMBATINA

École Nationale de Formation Judiciaire (ENFJ)
BP 426 Ndjamena
TCHAD

TOGO

TOGUINA Maredna

Procureur au Togo
S/C B.P. 352, Lome

TOGO

TUNISIE

Chikhaoui-Mahdaoui

Faculté des sciences juridiques, politiques et sociales de Tunis

14, Rue Hédi Karray, Centre urbain nord

BP 40, 1080 Tunis Cedex

TUNISIE

NIGER

Hama Sirfi Abdoulaye

École de Formation Judiciaire du Niger (EFJN)

BP 894 Niamey

NIGER

Madame Issaka Djibo Amina

École de Formation Judiciaire du Niger (EFJN)

BP894 Niamey

NIGER

CAMEROON

Philippe René NSOA

École Nationale d'Administration et de Magistrature

BP 7171 Yaoundé

CAMEROON

Emmanuel Dieudonné KAM YOGO

Faculté des Sciences Juridiques et Politiques

Université de Douala

CAMEROON

Marie NGO NONGA

Université de Yaoundé II SOA

Adresse postale S/C BP 7171 Yaoundé

CAMEROON

Parfait OUMBA

Université catholique d'Afrique centrale

CAMEROON

Jean KENFACK

Ministère de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la Nature et du Développement Durable

Immeuble Ministériel II, BP 320 Yaoundé

CAMEROON

Prudence GALEGA

Ministère de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la Nature et du Développement Durable

Immeuble Ministériel II, BP 320 Yaoundé

CAMEROON

Marcellin BEMMA

Ministère de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la Nature et du Développement Durable
Immeuble Ministériel II, BP 320, Yaoundé
CAMEROON

Isabelle HIEH née NGO NYOUMA

Ministère des Relations extérieures
CAMEROON

Saidou ADAMA

Directeur de la Promotion du Développement Durable
Ministère de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la Nature et du Développement Durable
Immeuble Ministériel II, BP 320, Yaoundé
CAMEROON

Gilles ZOH ONDO

Ministère de la Justice
CAMEROON

REPORTER

TAMASANG Christopher FUNWIE

Vice doyen en charge de la recherche et de la coopération
BP 1063, Yaoundé
CAMEROON

PRESSE ENVIRONNEMENTALE

Raoul Antoine SIEMENI KAMTCHEU

AFRIQUE ENVIRONNEMENT PLUS
1573 Avenue des 3 Martyrs, Plateau des 15 ans,
BP 12175 Brazzaville
REPUBLIC OF CONGO

François OSSAMA

Réseau d'information pour le développement durable en Afrique centrale (RIDDAC)
BP 12465 Yaoundé
CAMEROON

UNEP

Robert A. WABUNOHA

Regional Coordinator, Environment Governance
Africa Office - UN Environment
UNON Gigiri, New Office Facility, Block 2-1 South Wing
P. O. Box 30552 00100
Nairobi
KENYA

UICN

Aboubacar AWAISS

Coordonnateur Régional PREZOH, UICN – PACO
01 BP 1618 Ouagadougou 0

BURKINA FASO

Yacouba SAVADOGO

Expert Juriste
Bureau régional Afrique de l'Ouest et du Centre
01 BP 1618 Ouagadougou 01
BURKINA FASO

OIF

E. Lionelle NGO-SAMNICK

Spécialiste de programmes
Institut de la Francophonie pour le développement durable (IFDD)
Organisation internationale de la Francophonie
56, rue Saint-Pierre, 3e étage, Québec (Québec) G1K 4A1
CANADA

Evelyne Pauline ABORE-NZE

OIF-BRAC
BP 8075 Libreville
GABON

ONLINE PARTICIPATION

Antonio Herman BENJAMIN

Président de la Commission Mondiale du Droit de l'Environnement
SAFS-Quadra, Lote 1, Trecho III, Ed
Ministros I, 3º Andar, Brasilia- DF
Code Postal 70095-900
BRAZIL

Sophie LAVALLEE

Faculté de droit, Université Laval
Pavillon Charles-De Koninck
1030, ave. des Sciences-Humaines
Bureau 7113
Québec (Québec) G1V 0A6
CANADA